

MONZER MANSOUR, ATTORNEY AT LAW AND

WHITFIELD HYMAN, ATTORNEY AT LAW

COMPUTATION OF ESTIMATED RESIDENTIAL RECYCLING COSTS

OF THE CITY OF FORT SMITH ARKANSAS FOR THE

PERIOD JULY 1, 2015 THROUGH MAY 1, 2017

WITH RESPECT TO :

Case No. CV-17-637 In the Circuit Court of Sebastian County, Arkansas

By

M. LeRoy Duell, CFE, CPA of

KEEN & COMPANY CPAs, PLLC

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|--|-------|
| RECAPITULATION OF RESIDENTIAL RECYCLING COSTS | |
| ASSUMPTIONS MADE IN COMPUTATIONS | 1-2 |
| REAR LOADER UNIT COSTS | 3-5 |
| OPERATING COSTS OF REAR LOADER UNITS USED IN RESIDENTIAL RECYCLING | 6 |
| FUEL PRICE WORKSHEET | 7 |
| RESIDENTIAL RECYCLING CONTAINER COSTS | 8 |
| COST OF LABOR RECAPITULATION FOR THE PERIOD JULY 15, 2015 - MAY 1, 2017 | 9 |
| PERMANENT LABOR COSTS | 10-12 |
| ESTIMATED TOTAL COST SUPERVISOR COMPENSATION | 13 |
| TEMPORARY LABOR COSTS | 14-16 |
| DEVELOPMENT OF ADMINISTRATION RATIO (BACKUP RATIO) | 17 |
| ESTIMATED PERCENT OF RECYCLING STREAM SENT TO LANDFILL ADJUSTED TO UPDATED CLASS ACTION PERIOD OF JULY 1, 2015 - MAY 1, 2017 | 18 |

Merriott v. City of Fort Smith, Arkansas

Recapitulation of Residential Recycling Costs for the period July 1, 2015 - May 1, 2017

| | |
|---|-----------------------------|
| REAR LOADER CAPITAL COSTS | 27,040.19 |
| REAR LOADER OPERATION COSTS | 128,286.45 |
| CONTAINER COSTS | 85,219.02 |
| LABOR COSTS | <u>682,486.65</u> |
| TOTAL RESIDENTIAL RECYCLING COSTS | <u><u>\$ 923,032.31</u></u> |
| ESTIMATED PERCENT OF RECYCLING STREAM SENT TO THE LANDFILL DURING THE PERIOD IN QUESTION | <u>96.12%</u> |
| | <u><u>\$ 887,218.66</u></u> |

For Monzer Mansour, Attorney

J MERRIOTT VS. CITY OF FORT SMITH, ARKANSAS

ASSUMPTIONS MADE IN COMPUTATIONS –

1. Depreciation cost of Rear Loader Units – That Units 21,43,46,50,51,53 were acquired at or near the end of 2005 and were fully depreciated by the end of 2012. That Units 172 and 173 were fully depreciated before 2006. Therefore, no capital cost of rear loader units except for units #118 and #101 will be included.

Unit #118 was purchased April 30, 2015 for \$78,820.00. Its function was to be driven by the cart maintenance and delivery employee. We assumed it was utilized 50% for this function.

Unit #101 which was purchased November 11, 2015 was utilized 50% for Residential Recycling Activities.

2. The Rear Loader Units and the associated operating costs and labor were used one half for the Residential Recycling program and one half for other services.
3. The Purchase Orders and Invoices included in documents with Bates #5172-5481 represent typical fuel purchases at prices the Residential Recycling Service would have incurred during the period in question.
4. We computed recycling container costs for 11,688 units purchased per City of Fort Smith invoices incurred and paid during the period October 14 – April 17. We assumed a 10 year life and no salvage value for purposes of depreciation.

There may have been more containers acquired during the period in question with grant funds. We did not include their cost in our computations.

5. Based on the hourly pay rates of individual employees, pay grades were assigned for purposes of using the appropriate factor for payroll taxes and fringe benefits.
6. After reviewing the annual budgets of the City of Fort Smith for the fiscal years in which the period in question is included it was assumed the Residential Recycling Service had 1 supervisor paid with the pay grade of 11.

We assumed 13 full time equivalent employees were required to fulfill the residential recycling activities during the period in question. 13 full time equivalent employees work 40 hours each during a standard work week. A standard year for 13 FTEs would equal 27,040 hours worked.

We assumed that when the standard work hours of 13 FTEs were in excess of the actual total work hours of the permanent employees, the excess was filled with temporary labor.

Utilization of temporary employees is assumed to be the same as for permanent employees for Residential Recycling Activities 50%.

7. The annual budgets of the City of Fort Smith were reviewed to determine a factor for including Policy, Administrative and Management services in the total cost of the Residential Recycling Service. (Backup Ratio)

MERRIOTT V. CITY OF FORT SMITH

REAR LOADER UNIT COSTS-

- A VEHICLE CAPITAL COSTS - ALL UNITS EXCEPT #101 AND #118 WERE FULLY DEPRECIATED BEFORE THE TIME PERIOD IN QUESTION
- B ESTIMATED USEFUL LIFE 7 YEARS
- C ESTIMATED SALVAGE VALUE - PER THE SCHEDULE PROVIDED BY CITY OF FORT SMITH, THE SANITATION DEPARTMENT ESTIMATED THE SALVAGE COSTS WOULD BE 30% OF THE TOTAL ORIGINAL COST
- D DEPRECIABLE COST= ORIGINAL COST LESS ESTIMATED SALVAGE VALUE
- E ANNUAL DEPRECIATION= DEPRECIABLE COSTS DIVIDED BY THE ESTIMATED USEFUL LIFE OF THE ASSET
- F MULTIPLY ANNUAL DEPRECIATION BY THE BACKUP RATIO
SINCE ANNUAL DEPRECIATION IS ASSUMED TO BE -0-, THEN THE RESULT OF THIS CALCULATION WOULD BE -0- EXCEPT #101 AND #118.

MERRIOTT V. CITY OF FORT SMITH

REAR LOADER UNIT COSTS-

- A VEHICLE CAPITAL COSTS - ALL UNITS EXCEPT #101 AND #118 WERE FULLY DEPRECIATED BEFORE THE TIME PERIOD IN QUESTION
- B ESTIMATED USEFUL LIFE 7 YEARS
- C ESTIMATED SALVAGE VALUE - PER THE SCHEDULE PROVIDED BY CITY OF FORT SMITH, THE SANITATION DEPARTMENT ESTIMATED THE SALVAGE COSTS WOULD BE 30% OF THE TOTAL ORIGINAL COST
- D DEPRECIABLE COST= ORIGINAL COST LESS ESTIMATED SALVAGE VALUE
- E ANNUAL DEPRECIATION= DEPRECIABLE COSTS DIVIDED BY THE ESTIMATED USEFUL LIFE OF THE ASSET
- F MULTIPLY ANNUAL DEPRECIATION BY THE BACKUP RATIO

CAPITAL COSTS FOR UNIT #101-

| | | | |
|---|---|---|---------------------------|
| A | VEHICLE CAPITAL COST | 11/11/2015 PER INVOICE 969 DATED 11/11/2015 | \$229,057.92 |
| B | ESTIMATED USEFUL LIFE | 7 YEARS | |
| C | ESTIMATED SALVAGE VALUE - PER PRACTICE FOLLOWED BY CITY OF FORT SMITH ON OTHER UNITS. 30% OF THE TOTAL ORIGINAL COSTS | | \$68,717.38 |
| D | DEPRECIABLE COSTS- ORIGINAL COST LESS ESTIMATED SALVAGE VALUE | | \$160,340.54 |
| E | ANNUAL DEPRECIATION= DEPRECIABLE COSTS DIVIDED BY THE ESTIMATED USEFUL LIFE OF THE ASSET | | \$22,905.79 |
| F | MULTIPLY ANNUAL DEPRECIATION BY THE BACKUP RATIO | 1.108 | \$25,379.62 |
| | TOTAL COSTS NOVEMBER 12, 2015 THRU MAY 1, 2017 | | <u>\$38,069.43</u> |
| | Utilized 50% for Residential Recycling Activities | | <u><u>\$19,034.71</u></u> |

MERRIOTT V. CITY OF FORT SMITH

REAR LOADER UNIT COSTS-

- A VEHICLE CAPITAL COSTS - ALL UNITS EXCEPT #101 AND #118 WERE FULLY DEPRECIATED BEFORE THE TIME PERIOD IN QUESTION
- B ESTIMATED USEFUL LIFE 7 YEARS
- C ESTIMATED SALVAGE VALUE - PER THE SCHEDULE PROVIDED BY CITY OF FORT SMITH, THE SANITATION DEPARTMENT ESTIMATED THE SALVAGE COSTS WOULD BE 30% OF THE TOTAL ORIGINAL COST
- D DEPRECIABLE COST= ORIGINAL COST LESS ESTIMATED SALVAGE VALUE
- E ANNUAL DEPRECIATION= DEPRECIABLE COSTS DIVIDED BY THE ESTIMATED USEFUL LIFE OF THE ASSET
- F MULTIPLY ANNUAL DEPRECIATION BY THE BACKUP RATIO

CAPITAL COSTS FOR UNIT #118-

| | | | |
|---|---|--|--------------------------|
| A | VEHICLE CAPITAL COST | 4/30/2015 PER EMAIL DATED SEPTEMBER 30, 2018 | \$78,820.00 |
| B | ESTIMATED USEFUL LIFE | 7 YEARS | |
| C | ESTIMATED SALVAGE VALUE - PER PRACTICE FOLLOWED BY CITY OF FORT SMITH ON OTHER UNITS. 30% OF THE TOTAL ORIGINAL COSTS | | \$23,646.00 |
| D | DEPRECIABLE COSTS- ORIGINAL COST LESS ESTIMATED SALVAGE VALUE | | \$55,174.00 |
| E | ANNUAL DEPRECIATION= DEPRECIABLE COSTS DIVIDED BY THE ESTIMATED USEFUL LIFE OF THE ASSET | | \$7,882.00 |
| F | MULTIPLY ANNUAL DEPRECIATION BY THE BACKUP RATIO | 1.108 | \$8,733.26 |
| | TOTAL COSTS JULY 1, 2015 THRU MAY 1, 2017 | | \$16,010.97 |
| | UTILIZATION FOR RESIDENTIAL RECYCLING ACTIVITIES | | <u>50.00%</u> |
| | ESTIMATED CAPITAL COST FOR UNIT #118 | | <u><u>\$8,005.48</u></u> |

MERRIOTT V. CITY OF FORT SMITH
 OPERATING COSTS OF REAR LOADER UNITS USED IN RECYCLING

| BATES # RANGE | UNIT | REPAIRS & MAINTENANCE | | FUEL USAGE | AVERAGE | TAG & TITLE COST | | | | INSURANCE COST | | | | | |
|---|----------|-----------------------|-------------------|--------------------------|-----------------|-------------------|---------------|-------------|-------|----------------|---------------|----------|----------|----------|------------------|
| | | 07-01-15 thr | 05-01-17 | 07-01-2015 to 05-01-2017 | PRICE PER GAL | ESTIMATED | Tag & title | 01-01-17 to | | | TOTAL TAG | JAN-APR | | | |
| | | | | GALLON OF DYED DIESEL | FUEL PRICE WKST | FUEL COST | cost per year | 2015 | 2016 | 05-01-17 | & TITLE COST | 2015 | 2016 | 2017 | TOTAL |
| 4645-4660 | UNIT 172 | \$ | 11,545.86 | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 4661-4673 | | | | 5,656.90 | 1.6691 | 9,441.93 | 7.25 | 3.63 | 7.25 | 2.42 | 13.29 | 420.60 | 782.64 | 87.50 | 1,290.74 |
| 4687-4693 | UNIT 173 | | 4,521.59 | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 4681-4686 | | | | 1,879.40 | 1.6691 | 3,136.91 | 7.25 | 3.63 | 7.25 | 2.42 | 13.29 | 420.60 | 782.64 | 87.50 | 1,290.74 |
| 4709-4724 | UNIT 21 | | 8,177.94 | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 4697-4708 | | | | 3,302.10 | 1.6691 | 5,511.54 | 7.25 | 3.63 | 7.25 | 2.42 | 13.29 | 420.60 | 782.64 | 169.08 | 1,372.32 |
| 4748-4766 | UNIT 43 | | 13,655.19 | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 4732-4747 | | | | 7,946.40 | 1.6691 | 13,263.34 | 7.25 | 3.63 | 7.25 | 2.42 | 13.29 | 420.60 | 782.64 | 162.67 | 1,365.91 |
| 4795-4817 | UNIT 46 | | 23,459.36 | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 4777-4794 | | | | 8,427.30 | 1.6691 | 14,066.01 | 7.25 | 3.63 | 7.25 | 2.42 | 13.29 | 420.60 | 782.64 | 166.62 | 1,369.86 |
| 4846-4862 | UNIT 50 | | 24,655.35 | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 4830-4845 | | | | 6,725.00 | 1.6691 | 11,224.70 | 7.25 | 3.63 | 7.25 | 2.42 | 13.29 | 420.60 | 782.64 | 166.62 | 1,369.86 |
| 4889-4903 | UNIT 51 | | 15,511.19 | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 4873-4888 | | | | 7,505.20 | 1.6691 | 12,526.93 | 7.25 | 3.63 | 7.25 | 2.42 | 13.29 | 420.60 | 782.64 | 176.60 | 1,379.84 |
| 4930-4946 | UNIT 53 | | 15,544.37 | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 4914-4929 | | | | 7,330.30 | 1.6691 | 12,235.00 | 7.25 | 3.63 | 7.25 | 2.42 | 13.29 | 420.60 | 782.64 | 176.60 | 1,379.84 |
| EMAIL 083018 | UNIT 118 | | 1,959.02 | 4,100.60 | 1.6691 | 6,844.31 | 7.25 | 3.63 | 7.25 | 2.42 | 13.30 | 280.40 | 782.64 | 176.60 | 1,239.64 |
| EMAIL 100418 | UNIT 101 | | 14,085.12 | 7,591.50 | 1.6691 | 12,670.97 | 7.25 | 3.63 | 7.25 | 2.42 | 13.29 | 420.60 | 782.64 | 176.60 | 1,379.84 |
| | | | <u>117,070.85</u> | <u>60,464.70</u> | | <u>100,921.63</u> | 72.50 | 36.25 | 72.50 | 24.17 | <u>132.92</u> | 4,065.80 | 7,826.40 | 1,546.38 | <u>13,438.58</u> |
| REPAIRS & MAINTENANCE | | | 117,070.85 | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| FUEL COST | | | 100,921.63 | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| TAG & TITLE COST | | | 132.92 | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| INSURANCE COST | | | 13,438.58 | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| TOTAL OPERATING COSTS | | | <u>231,563.98</u> | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Backup Ratio | | | <u>1.108</u> | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| TOTAL OPERATING COSTS INCLUDING ADMIN SERVICES UTILIZATION RATE | | | <u>256,572.89</u> | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | <u>50%</u> | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| TOTAL FOR RES. RECYCLING | | | <u>128,286.45</u> | | | | | | | | | | | | |

MERRIOTT V. CITY OF FORT SMITH
 FUEL PRICE WORKSHEET

| <u>BATES # RANGE</u> | <u>PO NUMBER</u> | <u>DATE</u> | <u>GALLONS</u> | <u>PURCHASE TOTAL</u> | <u>AVERAGE PRICE PER GALLON</u> |
|----------------------|------------------|-------------|----------------|-----------------------|---------------------------------|
| 5172-5181 | 405369 | 7/6/2015 | 14914 | 30,038.36 | 2.0141 |
| 5194-5207 | 405497 | 8/4/2015 | 21333 | 38,533.92 | 1.8063 |
| 5208-5230 | 405617 | 9/7/2015 | 37462 | 67,758.20 | 1.8087 |
| 5243-5249 | 405760 | 10/5/2015 | 13404 | 24,294.20 | 1.8125 |
| 5250-5277 | 405898 | 11/5/2015 | 25604 | 42,932.89 | 1.6768 |
| 5278-5304 | 406162 | 1/12/2016 | 26302 | 30,148.04 | 1.1462 |
| 5315-5324 | 406358 | 3/1/2016 | 27437 | 37,310.08 | 1.3598 |
| 5325-5347 | 406746 | 6/8/2016 | 58721 | 88,005.31 | 1.4987 |
| 5348-5361 | 406849 | 7/5/2016 | 42890 | 69,914.42 | 1.6301 |
| 5362-5364 | 406971 | 8/2/2016 | 4695 | 7,803.90 | 1.6622 |
| 5369-5380 | 407131 | 9/8/2016 | 14766 | 23,772.27 | 1.6099 |
| 5399-5401 | 407240 | 10/2/2016 | 2993 | 5,103.03 | 1.7050 |
| 5406-5408 | 407422 | 11/6/2016 | 5977 | 9,619.35 | 1.6094 |
| 5431-5437 | 407508 | 12/4/2016 | 15824 | 26,831.32 | 1.6956 |
| 5445-5449 | 407637 | 1/9/2017 | 13524 | 24,598.27 | 1.8189 |
| 5463-5468 | 407782 | 2/3/2017 | 12650 | 22,198.92 | 1.7549 |
| 5476-5481 | 407887 | 2/28/2017 | 11794 | 20,250.36 | 1.7170 |
| 5309-5311 | 408126 | 5/2/2017 | 7348 | 12,627.94 | 1.7186 |

AVERAGE PRICE PER GALLON OF DYED DIESEL BASED ON THE
 INVOICES INCLUDED IN THE ABOVE REFERENCED PURCHASE ORDERS

\$ 1.6691

FORT SMITH RECYCLING CONTAINER CAPITAL COSTS

| <u>INVOICE NO.</u> | <u>INVOICE DATE</u> | <u>UNITS</u> | | <u>INVOICE</u> | | <u>2015</u> | <u>2016</u> | <u>JAN-APR 17</u> | <u>TOTAL</u> |
|--------------------|---------------------|------------------|-------------------|-------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|-------------------|--------------|
| | | <u>PURCHASED</u> | <u>UNIT PRICE</u> | <u>TOTAL</u> | | | | | |
| KB245123 | 5/27/2009 | 1000 | 24.83 | 24,830.00 | 1,241.50 | 2,483.00 | 827.67 | 4,552.17 | |
| ER81547 | 7/14/2009 | 1144 | 16.68 | 19,081.92 | 954.10 | 1,908.19 | 636.06 | 3,498.35 | |
| 43372 | 4/7/2010 | 500 | 17.99 | 8,995.00 | 449.75 | 899.50 | 299.83 | 1,649.08 | |
| KA91075 | 4/19/2011 | 500 | 42.60 | 21,300.00 | 1,065.00 | 2,130.00 | 710.00 | 3,905.00 | |
| KA91694 | 7/6/2011 | 648 | 43.99 | 28,505.52 | 1,425.28 | 2,850.55 | 950.18 | 5,226.01 | |
| KA91698 | 7/6/2011 | 648 | 43.99 | 28,505.52 | 1,425.28 | 2,850.55 | 950.18 | 5,226.01 | |
| KA91699 | 7/7/2011 | 648 | 43.99 | 28,505.52 | 1,425.28 | 2,850.55 | 950.18 | 5,226.01 | |
| KA91700 | 7/7/2011 | 56 | 58.67 | 3,285.52 | 164.28 | 328.55 | 109.52 | 602.35 | |
| KA93622 | 2/29/2012 | 2710 | 46.01 | 124,673.55 | 6,233.68 | 12,467.36 | 4,155.79 | 22,856.82 | |
| KE75157 | 12/31/2012 | 400 | 46.01 | 18,402.00 | 920.10 | 1,840.20 | 613.40 | 3,373.70 | |
| KA96802-3 | 12/2/2013 | 1000 | 44.35 | 44,349.68 | 2,217.48 | 4,434.97 | 1,478.32 | 8,130.77 | |
| KA97443 | 4/29/2013 | 648 | 45.35 | 29,384.59 | 1,469.23 | 2,938.46 | 979.49 | 5,387.17 | |
| KE76900 | 8/9/2013 | 648 | 45.56 | 29,521.09 | 1,476.05 | 2,952.11 | 984.04 | 5,412.20 | |
| KA99981 | 1/27/2014 | 490 | 48.76 | 23,893.35 | 1,194.67 | 2,389.34 | 796.45 | 4,380.45 | |
| KA99971 | 1/26/2014 | 648 | 48.76 | 31,597.73 | 1,579.89 | 3,159.77 | 1,053.26 | 5,792.92 | |
| | | <u>11688</u> | | <u>464,830.99</u> | <u>23,241.55</u> | <u>46,483.10</u> | <u>15,494.37</u> | <u>85,219.02</u> | |

MERRIOTT V. CITY OF FORT SMITH
 COST OF LABOR RECAPITULATION FOR THE PERIOD JULY 1, 2015 TO MAY 1, 2017

| <u>DESCRIPTION</u> | <u>OCT 1, 2014</u> <u>DECEMBER 31, 2014</u> | <u>2015</u> | <u>2016</u> | <u>JAN 1, 2017</u> <u>TO MAY 1, 2017</u> | <u>TOTAL</u> |
|-----------------------------------|--|-------------|-------------|---|--------------|
| LABOR | - | 137,130.93 | 304,600.61 | 109,898.84 | 551,630.38 |
| TEMPORARY LABOR | - | - | - | - | - |
| SUPERVISOR | - | 17,569.75 | 35,139.49 | 11,623.06 | 64,332.30 |
| TOTAL | - | 154,700.68 | 339,740.10 | 121,521.90 | 615,962.68 |
| BACKUP RATIO | - | 1.108 | 1.108 | 1.108 | |
| TOTAL INCLUDING ADMIN SERVICES | - | 171,408.35 | 376,432.03 | 134,646.27 | 682,486.65 |

MERRIOTT V. CITY OF FORT SMITH
 LABOR COSTS - JULY - DECEMBER - 2015

| <u>DEPT NO</u> | <u>EMPLOYEE NO.</u> | <u>EMPLOYEE NAME</u> | <u>JANUARY - DECEMBER 15</u> | <u>JANUARY- JUNE 15</u> | <u>GROSS WAGE TOTAL</u> | <u>PAY GRADE</u> | <u>RFP13 SALARY PACKAGE FACTOR</u> | <u>TOTAL WAGES, TAXES AND BENEFITS</u> |
|---------------------------------|---------------------|--------------------------|------------------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|------------------|------------------------------------|--|
| 6302 | 8549 | SCARBOROUGH, DARRIN | 26,477.92 | 26,477.92 | - | 5 | 1.373397 | - |
| 6302 | 20042 | SMITH ROOSEVELT | 37,775.23 | 18,967.55 | 18,807.68 | 5 | 1.373397 | 25,830.41 |
| 6302 | 20298 | KELLEY SCOTT ALLEN | 33,804.53 | 17,608.44 | 16,196.09 | 5 | 1.373397 | 22,243.66 |
| 6302 | 20489 | SELLERS MICHAEL E | 33,323.96 | 16,853.45 | 16,470.51 | 5 | 1.373397 | 22,620.55 |
| 6302 | 20774 | PARKER CALVIN WAYNE | 30,049.80 | 15,471.36 | 14,578.44 | 4 | 1.393176 | 20,310.33 |
| 6302 | 20810 | BISHOP VINCENT MARTINEZ | 32,164.07 | 16,111.89 | 16,052.18 | 5 | 1.373397 | 22,046.02 |
| 6302 | 21006 | EVANS JAMES GUY | 28,718.82 | 14,760.98 | 13,957.84 | 4 | 1.393176 | 19,445.73 |
| 6302 | 21010 | KEITH JOHNNY L JR | 29,272.72 | 14,740.00 | 14,532.72 | 5 | 1.373397 | 19,959.19 |
| 6302 | 21024 | GRIFFIN EDWARD CHARLES | 18,761.47 | 14,759.37 | 4,002.10 | 4 | 1.393176 | 5,575.63 |
| 6302 | 20517 | NELSON SANFORD EUGENE JR | 36,538.85 | 18,269.43 | 18,269.42 | 5 | 1.373397 | 25,091.17 |
| 6302 | 20897 | FIMPEL DUSTIN OWENS | 32,749.99 | 16,375.00 | 16,374.99 | 4 | 1.393176 | 22,813.24 |
| 6302 | 21039 | BOWDEN EARNEST D | 17,017.58 | | 17,017.58 | 4 | 1.393176 | 23,708.48 |
| 6302 | 21046 | JOSEMBERGER ROY ALLAN | 22,844.25 | 8,643.25 | 14,201.00 | 4 | 1.393176 | 19,784.49 |
| 6302 | 21060 | GIBBS JESSY DON | 17,824.70 | | 17,824.70 | 4 | 1.393176 | 24,832.94 |
| TOTAL | | | <u>397,323.89</u> | <u>199,038.64</u> | <u>198,285.25</u> | | | <u>274,261.85</u> |
| UTILIZATION RATE | | | | | | | | <u>50%</u> |
| TOTAL FOR RESIDENTIAL RECYCLING | | | | | | | | <u><u>137,130.93</u></u> |

NOT INCLUDED ON THE PROVIDED SCHEDULE OF JAN-JUNE 2015, BASED ON HOURS INCLUDED ON HALF

*

MERRIOTT V. CITY OF FORT SMITH
 LABOR COSTS - JANUARY - DECEMBER - 2016

| <u>DEPT NO</u> | <u>EMPLOYEE NO.</u> | <u>EMPLOYEE NAME</u> | <u>JANUARY - DECEMBER 16</u> | <u>GROSS WAGE TOTAL</u> | <u>PAY GRADE</u> | <u>RFP13 SALARY PACKAGE FACTOR</u> | <u>TOTAL WAGES, TAXES AND BENEFITS</u> |
|----------------|---------------------|---------------------------------|------------------------------|-------------------------|------------------|------------------------------------|--|
| 6302 | 20042 | SMITH ROOSEVELT | 28,035.66 | 28,035.66 | 5 | 1.373397 | 38,504.09 |
| 6302 | 20298 | KELLEY SCOTT ALLEN | 33,008.87 | 33,008.87 | 5 | 1.373397 | 45,334.28 |
| 6302 | 20489 | SELLERS MICHAEL E | 33,535.25 | 33,535.25 | 5 | 1.373397 | 46,057.21 |
| 6302 | 20774 | PARKER CALVIN WAYNE | 31,261.53 | 31,261.53 | 5 | 1.373397 | 42,934.49 |
| 6302 | 20810 | BISHOP VINCENT MARTINEZ | 20,624.65 | 20,624.65 | 5 | 1.373397 | 28,325.83 |
| 6302 | 21006 | EVANS JAMES GUY | 29,702.66 | 29,702.66 | 4 | 1.393176 | 41,381.03 |
| 6302 | 21010 | KEITH JOHNNY L JR | 31,808.85 | 31,808.85 | 5 | 1.373397 | 43,686.18 |
| 6302 | 20517 | NELSON SANFORD EUGENE JR | 40,012.03 | 40,012.03 | 5 | 1.373397 | 54,952.40 |
| 6302 | 20897 | FIMPEL DUSTIN OWENS | 16,344.06 | 16,344.06 | 4 | 1.393176 | 22,770.15 |
| 6302 | 21046 | JOSEMBERGER ROY ALLAN | 13,542.59 | 13,542.59 | 4 | 1.393176 | 18,867.21 |
| 6302 | 21060 | GIBBS JESSY DON | 21,180.47 | 21,180.47 | 4 | 1.393176 | 29,508.12 |
| 6302 | 9818 | MULLIS CLINT WADE | 12,211.27 | 12,211.27 | 4 | 1.393176 | 17,012.45 |
| 6302 | 20434 | BELT JOHN C | 9,518.10 | 9,518.10 | 4 | 1.393176 | 13,260.39 |
| 6302 | 20668 | ORTIZ CESAR A | 8,430.22 | 8,430.22 | 4 | 1.393176 | 11,744.78 |
| 6302 | 20852 | GARCIA BARROSO GUSTAVO | 20,762.52 | 20,762.52 | 4 | 1.393176 | 28,925.84 |
| 6302 | 21103 | PHELAN JOSHUA MATTHEW | 8,830.45 | 8,830.45 | 4 | 1.393176 | 12,302.37 |
| 6302 | 21167 | FLEMING CAMERON LEON | 903.70 | 903.70 | 4 | 1.393176 | 1,259.01 |
| 6302 | 21168 | HOLLAN CODY LEE | 16,610.87 | 16,610.87 | 4 | 1.393176 | 23,141.87 |
| 6302 | 21169 | FOLSOM BRIAN R | 23,179.90 | 23,179.90 | 4 | 1.393176 | 32,293.68 |
| 6302 | 21191 | BARBER DUSTIN WAYNE | 2,947.38 | 2,947.38 | 4 | 1.393176 | 4,106.22 |
| 6302 | 21198 | MORTENSEN JOHN A | 18,808.26 | 18,808.26 | 4 | 1.393176 | 26,203.22 |
| 6302 | 21249 | WELLS DERRICK | 13,997.67 | 13,997.67 | 4 | 1.393176 | 19,501.22 |
| 6302 | 21303 | TUCKER JAMES EDWARD | 5,117.20 | 5,117.20 | 4 | 1.393176 | 7,129.16 |
| | | TOTAL | <u>440,374.16</u> | <u>440,374.16</u> | | | <u>609,201.22</u> |
| | | UTILIZATION RATE | | | | | <u>50%</u> |
| | | TOTAL FOR RESIDENTIAL RECYCLING | | | | | <u>304,600.61</u> |

MERRIOTT V. CITY OF FORT SMITH
 LABOR COSTS - JANUARY 1 -MAY 1 - 2017

| <u>DEPT NO</u> | <u>EMPLOYEE NO.</u> | <u>EMPLOYEE NAME</u> | <u>JANUARY - MAY 17</u> | <u>GROSS WAGE TOTAL</u> | <u>PAY GRADE</u> | <u>RFP13 SALARY PACKAGE FACTOR</u> | <u>TOTAL WAGES, TAXES AND BENEFITS</u> | <u>ESTIMATED MAY 17 WAGES</u> | <u>JAN 1 - MAY 1 17 WAGES, TAXES BENEFITS</u> |
|---------------------------------|---------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|------------------|------------------------------------|--|-------------------------------|---|
| 6302 | 20298 | KELLEY SCOTT ALLEN | 15,054.99 | 15,054.99 | 5 | 1.373397 | 20,676.48 | 4,135.30 | 16,541.18 |
| 6302 | 20489 | SELLERS MICHAEL E | 14,435.94 | 14,435.94 | 5 | 1.373397 | 19,826.28 | 3,965.26 | 15,861.02 |
| 6302 | 20774 | PARKER CALVIN WAYNE | 12,931.27 | 12,931.27 | 5 | 1.373397 | 17,759.77 | 3,551.95 | 14,207.81 |
| 6302 | 21006 | EVANS JAMES GUY | 13,397.87 | 13,397.87 | 4 | 1.393176 | 18,665.59 | 3,733.12 | 14,932.47 |
| 6302 | 21010 | KEITH JOHNNY L JR | 14,120.03 | 14,120.03 | 5 | 1.373397 | 19,392.41 | 3,878.48 | 15,513.93 |
| 6302 | 20517 | NELSON SANFORD EUGENE JR | 18,162.22 | 18,162.22 | 5 | 1.373397 | 24,943.94 | 4,988.79 | 19,955.15 |
| 6302 | 9818 | MULLIS CLINT WADE | 12,750.25 | 12,750.25 | 4 | 1.393176 | 17,763.34 | 3,552.67 | 14,210.67 |
| 6302 | 20668 | ORTIZ CESAR A | 12,235.48 | 12,235.48 | 4 | 1.393176 | 17,046.18 | 3,409.24 | 13,636.94 |
| 6302 | 20852 | GARCIA BARROSO GUSTAVO | 12,947.56 | 12,947.56 | 4 | 1.393176 | 18,038.23 | 3,607.65 | 14,430.58 |
| 6302 | 21103 | PHELAN JOSHUA MATTHEW | 12,648.58 | 12,648.58 | 4 | 1.393176 | 17,621.70 | 3,524.34 | 14,097.36 |
| 6302 | 21168 | HOLLAN CODY LEE | 10,712.10 | 10,712.10 | 4 | 1.393176 | 14,923.84 | 2,984.77 | 11,939.07 |
| 6302 | 21169 | FOLSOM BRIAN R | 13,049.79 | 13,049.79 | 4 | 1.393176 | 18,180.65 | 3,636.13 | 14,544.52 |
| 6302 | 21198 | MORTENSEN JOHN A | 12,275.80 | 12,275.80 | 4 | 1.393176 | 17,102.35 | 3,420.47 | 13,681.88 |
| 6302 | 21249 | WELLS DERRICK | 10,726.61 | 10,726.61 | 4 | 1.393176 | 14,944.06 | 2,988.81 | 11,955.24 |
| 6302 | 21303 | TUCKER JAMES EDWARD | 9,997.21 | 9,997.21 | 4 | 1.393176 | 13,927.87 | 2,785.57 | 11,142.30 |
| 6302 | 9849 | DAVIDSON JOSEPH EARL | 608.38 | 608.38 | 4 | 1.393176 | 847.58 | 169.52 | 678.06 |
| 6302 | 20379 | WALD WILLIAM BRAUN | 309.84 | 309.84 | 4 | 1.393176 | 431.66 | 86.33 | 345.33 |
| 6302 | 21359 | BOYD CHRISTOPHER ALLAN | 1,776.74 | 1,776.74 | 4 | 1.393176 | 2,475.31 | 495.06 | 1,980.25 |
| 6302 | 21370 | ROGERS KEITH L | 129.10 | 129.10 | 4 | 1.393176 | 179.86 | 35.97 | 143.89 |
| TOTAL | | | 198,269.76 | 198,269.76 | | | 274,747.09 | 54,949.42 | 219,797.67 |
| UTILIZATION RATE | | | | | | | | | 50% |
| TOTAL FOR RESIDENTIAL RECYCLING | | | | | | | | | 109,898.84 |

MERRIOTT V. CITY OF FORT SMITH

Details of Supervisor Compensation were derived from the document provided by City of Fort Smith entitled Salary Package for Grade 11 for 2018 budget.

Yearly base salary \$ 55,510.00

I assumed the salary amount is based on a 2,080 work year (40 hours per week)

The multiplier to arrive at the total cost including payroll taxes and benefits- 1.2660598

| Days worked for the period- | Hours per day | Hours Worked for the period | Pay rate per hour | Estimated Base Pay | Taxes & Benefits Multiplier | Estimated Total cost Supervisor Compensation | |
|--|---------------|-----------------------------|-------------------|--------------------|-----------------------------|--|-------------------------|
| July 1, 2015 through December 31, 2015 | 130 | 8 | 1040 | 26.6875 | 27,755.00 | 1.2660598 | 35,139.49 |
| The year 2016 | 260 | 8 | 2080 | 26.6875 | 55,510.00 | 1.2660598 | 70,278.98 |
| January 1, 2017 through May 1, 2017 | 86 | 8 | 688 | 26.6875 | 18,361.00 | 1.2660598 | 23,246.12 |
| | | | | | <u>101,626.00</u> | | <u>128,664.59</u> |
| UTILIZATION RATE | | | | | | | <u>50%</u> |
| TOTAL FOR RESIDENTIAL RECYCLING | | | | | | | <u><u>64,332.30</u></u> |

MERRIOTT V. CITY OF FORT SMITH
 TEMPORARY LABOR COSTS - JULY - DECEMBER - 2015

| <u>DEPT NO</u> | <u>EMPLOYEE NO.</u> | <u>EMPLOYEE NAME</u> | <u>WORK HOURS</u> | | |
|----------------|---------------------|------------------------------------|-------------------|----------|-----------------|
| 6302 | 20042 | SMITH ROOSEVELT | 1022.25 | | |
| 6302 | 20298 | KELLEY SCOTT ALLEN | 949.75 | | |
| 6302 | 20489 | SELLERS MICHAEL E | 980.00 | | |
| 6302 | 20774 | PARKER CALVIN WAYNE | 1020.00 | | |
| 6302 | 20810 | BISHOP VINCENT MARTINEZ | 960.00 | | |
| 6302 | 21006 | EVANS JAMES GUY | 1040.00 | | |
| 6302 | 21010 | KEITH JOHNNY L JR | 1040.00 | | |
| 6302 | 21024 | GRIFFIN EDWARD CHARLES | 286.00 | | |
| 6302 | 20517 | NELSON SANFORD EUGENE JR | 1980.25 | | |
| 6302 | 20897 | FIMPEL DUSTIN OWENS | 2225.50 | | |
| 6302 | 21039 | BOWDEN EARNEST D | 1223.00 | | |
| 6302 | 21046 | JOSENBURGER ROY ALLAN | 1080.00 | | |
| 6302 | 21060 | GIBBS JESSY DON | 1479.50 | | |
| | | TOTAL | 15286.25 | | |
| | | STANDARD HOURS 13 FULL TIME EQUIV | 13520.00 | RATE | |
| | | NO TEMP LABOR UNDER THE ASSUMPTION | | \$ 10.80 | \$ - |
| | | UTILIZATION RATE | | | <u>0.5</u> |
| | | TOTAL FOR RESIDENTIAL RECYCLING | | \$ | <u><u>-</u></u> |

MERRIOTT V. CITY OF FORT SMITH
 TEMPORARY LABOR COSTS - JANUARY - DECEMBER - 2016

| <u>DEPT NO</u> | <u>EMPLOYEE NO.</u> | <u>EMPLOYEE NAME</u> | <u>WORK HOURS</u> |
|----------------|---------------------|------------------------------------|-------------------|
| 6302 | 20042 | SMITH ROOSEVELT | 1353.50 |
| 6302 | 20298 | KELLEY SCOTT ALLEN | 1891.00 |
| 6302 | 20489 | SELLERS MICHAEL E | 2086.25 |
| 6302 | 20774 | PARKER CALVIN WAYNE | 1864.50 |
| 6302 | 20810 | BISHOP VINCENT MARTINEZ | 1224.25 |
| 6302 | 21006 | EVANS JAMES GUY | 2049.25 |
| 6302 | 21010 | KEITH JOHNNY L JR | 2115.00 |
| 6302 | 20517 | NELSON SANFORD EUGENE JR | 2113.25 |
| 6302 | 20897 | FIMPEL DUSTIN OWENS | 991.00 |
| 6302 | 21046 | JOSENBARGER ROY ALLAN | 928.00 |
| 6302 | 21060 | GIBBS JESSY DON | 1483.00 |
| 6302 | 9818 | MULLIS CLINT WADE | 921.50 |
| 6302 | 20434 | BELT JOHN C | 639.00 |
| 6302 | 20668 | ORTIZ CESAR A | 617.00 |
| 6302 | 20852 | GARCIA BARROSO GUSTAVO | 1575.50 |
| 6302 | 21103 | PHELAN JOSHUA MATTHEW | 650.50 |
| 6302 | 21167 | FLEMING CAMERON LEON | 70.00 |
| 6302 | 21168 | HOLLAN CODY LEE | 1354.50 |
| 6302 | 21169 | FOLSOM BRIAN R | 1757.00 |
| 6302 | 21191 | BARBER DUSTIN WAYNE | 342.75 |
| 6302 | 21198 | MORTENSEN JOHN A | 1384.00 |
| 6302 | 21249 | WELLS DERRICK | 1056.00 |
| 6302 | 21303 | TUCKER JAMES EDWARD | 379.75 |
| | | TOTAL | 28846.50 |
| | | STANDARD HOURS 13 FULL TIME EQUIV. | 27040.00 |
| | | | No Temp Labor |

MERRIOTT V. CITY OF FORT SMITH
 TEMPORARY LABOR COSTS - JANUARY 1 -MAY 1 - 2017

| <u>DEPT NO</u> | <u>EMPLOYEE NO.</u> | <u>EMPLOYEE NAME</u> | <u>WORK HOURS</u> | <u>ESTIMATED MAY HOURS</u> | <u>ESTIMATED HOURS JAN-APR 17</u> |
|----------------|---------------------|--------------------------|-------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 6302 | 20298 | KELLEY SCOTT ALLEN | 919.00 | 183.80 | 735.20 |
| 6302 | 20489 | SELLERS MICHAEL E | 685.00 | 137.00 | 548.00 |
| 6302 | 20774 | PARKER CALVIN WAYNE | 720.50 | 144.10 | 576.40 |
| 6302 | 21006 | EVANS JAMES GUY | 920.25 | 184.05 | 736.20 |
| 6302 | 21010 | KEITH JOHNNY L JR | 940.50 | 188.10 | 752.40 |
| 6302 | 20517 | NELSON SANFORD EUGENE JR | 939.00 | 187.80 | 751.20 |
| 6302 | 9818 | MULLIS CLINT WADE | 913.00 | 182.60 | 730.40 |
| 6302 | 20668 | ORTIZ CESAR A | 892.25 | 178.45 | 713.80 |
| 6302 | 20852 | GARCIA BARROSO GUSTAVO | 956.25 | 191.25 | 765.00 |
| 6302 | 21103 | PHELAN JOSHUA MATTHEW | 906.25 | 181.25 | 725.00 |
| 6302 | 21168 | HOLLAN CODY LEE | 789.25 | 157.85 | 631.40 |
| 6302 | 21169 | FOLSOM BRIAN R | 961.50 | 192.30 | 769.20 |
| 6302 | 21198 | MORTENSEN JOHN A | 855.75 | 171.15 | 684.60 |
| 6302 | 21249 | WELLS DERRICK | 784.00 | 156.80 | 627.20 |
| 6302 | 21303 | TUCKER JAMES EDWARD | 714.75 | 142.95 | 571.80 |
| 6302 | 9849 | DAVIDSON JOSEPH EARL | 44.75 | 8.95 | 35.80 |
| 6302 | 20379 | WALD WILLIAM BRAUN | 24.00 | 4.80 | 19.20 |
| 6302 | 21359 | BOYD CHRISTOPHER ALLAN | 131.75 | 26.35 | 105.40 |
| 6302 | 21370 | ROGERS KEITH L | 10.00 | 2.00 | 8.00 |
| | | TOTAL | 13107.75 | 2621.55 | 10486.20 |

STANDARD HOURS 13 FULL TIME EQUIV.

8840.00
 NO TEMPORARY LABOR

MERRIOTT V. CITY OF FORT SMITH
 DEVELOPMENT OF ADMINISTRATION RATIO (BACKUP RATIO)

| BUDGET PAGE NO. PER BUDGET- | <u>PAGE 83</u> | <u>PROPOSED</u> <u>PAGE 10</u> | <u>PAGE 83</u> | |
|--|----------------|-----------------------------------|----------------|-------------------------|
| | <u>2015</u> | <u>2016</u> | <u>2017</u> | |
| POLICY, ADMIN, AND MANAGEMENT SERVICES | 1,007,096 | 989,898 | 1,216,997 | |
| OPERATION SERVICES | 9,802,350 | 9,976,405 | 9,957,337 | |
| OPERATING BUDGET | 10,809,446 | 10,966,303 | 11,174,334 | |
| RATIO OF TOTAL TO OPERATON SERVICES | 1.103 | 1.099 | 1.122 | <u>1.108</u> AVERAGE |

Recycling Tonnage July 14 Through May 17

| <u>Month & Year</u> | <u>Total Estimated Recycling Received</u> | <u>Recycling Sent to Green Source</u> | <u>Estimated Net Amount of Recycling Placed in Landfill</u> | <u>Estimated Percent of Recycling Stream Sent to Landfill</u> |
|------------------------------------|--|--|--|--|
| August 15 | 279.54 | 42.99 | 236.55 | 84.62% |
| September 15 | 281.35 | 42.85 | 238.50 | 84.77% |
| October 15 | 283.18 | 34.83 | 248.35 | 87.70% |
| November 15 | 285.02 | 27.98 | 257.04 | 90.18% |
| December 15 | 286.88 | 29.51 | 257.37 | 89.71% |
| January 16 | 288.74 | 26.85 | 261.89 | 90.70% |
| February 16 | 290.62 | 21.03 | 269.59 | 92.76% |
| March 16 | 292.51 | 8.49 | 284.02 | 97.10% |
| April 16 | 294.41 | 3.53 | 290.88 | 98.80% |
| May 16 | 296.32 | 7.76 | 288.56 | 97.38% |
| June 16 | 298.25 | 9.73 | 288.52 | 96.74% |
| July 16 | 300.19 | 0.00 | 300.19 | 100.00% |
| August 16 | 302.14 | 0.00 | 302.14 | 100.00% |
| September 16 | 304.10 | 0.00 | 304.10 | 100.00% |
| October 16 | 306.08 | 0.00 | 306.08 | 100.00% |
| November 16 | 308.07 | 0.00 | 308.07 | 100.00% |
| December 16 | 310.07 | 0.00 | 310.07 | 100.00% |
| January 17 | 312.09 | 0.00 | 312.09 | 100.00% |
| February 17 | 314.11 | 0.00 | 314.11 | 100.00% |
| March 17 | 316.16 | 0.00 | 316.16 | 100.00% |
| April 17 | 318.21 | 0.00 | 318.21 | 100.00% |
| May 17 | 320.28 | 0.00 | 320.28 | 100.00% |
| Total | <u><u>6588.32</u></u> | <u><u>255.55</u></u> | <u><u>6332.77</u></u> | 96.12% |